

Agenda Date: 12/14/11 Agenda Item: VIID

STATE OF NEW JERSEY Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 www.nj.gov/bpu/

### CUSTOMER ASSISTANCE

MARY E. WHITMORE, Petitioner	) )	ORDER ADOPTING INITIAL DECISION AND SETTLEMENT
V.	)	
ELIZABETHTOWN GAS, Respondent	) ) )	BPU DKT. NO. GC10090658U OAL DKT. NO. PUC08392-11

Bruce H. Bergen Esq., on behalf of Petitioner, Mary E. Whitmore

Deborah Franco, Esq., on behalf of Respondent, Pivotal Utility Holdings, Inc. d/b/a Elizabethtown Gas

BY THE BOARD:

On September 13, 2010, Mary E. Whitmore ("Petitioner") filed a petition with the Board of Public Utilities ("Board") requesting a formal hearing related to a billing dispute with Pivotal Utility Holdings, Inc., d/b/a Elizabethtown Gas ("Respondent") for utility services rendered by Respondent.

After the filing of Respondent's answer, the Board transmitted this matter to the Office of Administrative Law ("OAL") for hearing and initial disposition as a contested case pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 52:14B-1 <u>et seq.</u> and <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 52:14F-1 <u>et seq.</u> This matter was assigned to Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") Irene Jones.

While this matter was pending at the OAL, the parties engaged in negotiations and entered into and signed a Stipulation of Settlement ("Settlement") that was submitted to the ALJ. By Initial Decision issued on November 16, 2011, and submitted to the Board on November 21, 2011, to which the Settlement was attached and made part thereof, ALJ Jones found that the Settlement was voluntary, that its terms fully disposed of all issues in controversy and that it

satisfied the requirements of <u>N.J.A.C.</u> 1:1-19.1. Pursuant to the terms of the Settlement, and in order to fully resolve this matter, Respondent, without agreeing to the merits of the allegations set out in the petition and in the interest of good customer relations, will adjust Respondent's Outstanding Balance downward to \$480.00 ("Adjusted Outstanding Balance"). Said adjustment will be reflected on the billing statement issued to Petitioner after the Stipulation is approved. In return, Petitioner will enter into a deferred payment agreement which shall provide for monthly payments of \$20.00, in addition to the monthly bill received by Petitioner from Respondent for gas service, until Petitioner has fully paid the Adjusted Outstanding Balance.

After review of the record and the Settlement of the parties, the Board <u>HEREBY FINDS</u> that the parties have voluntarily agreed to the Settlement as evidenced by their signatures and that by the terms of the Settlement, have fully resolved all outstanding contested issues in this matter.

Accordingly, the Board <u>HEREBY ADOPTS</u> the Initial Decision and the Settlement executed by the parties in their entirety as if fully set forth herein.

DATED: 12/15/11 BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY: LEE A. SOLOMON PRESIDENT 11. 10 JEANNE M. FOX OSEPH FIORDALISO COMMISSIONER COMMISSIONER NICHOLAS ASSELTA COMMISSIONER I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original ATTEST: in the files of the Board of Public Utilities **KRISTI IZZO** SECRETARY

BPU DOCKET NO.GC10090658U OAL DOCKET NO. PUC08392-11

## MARY E. WHITMORE

V.

# PIVOTAL UTILITY HOLDINGS, INC., D/B/A ELIZABETHTOWN GAS

#### BPU DOCKET NO. GC10090658U OAL DOCKET NO. PUC08392-11

### SERVICE LIST

Bruce H. Bergen, Esq. Krevsky, Silber & Bergen 123 North Union Avenue – Suite 202 P.O. Box 99 Cranford, New Jersey 07106-0099

Deborah M. Franco, Esq. Cullen and Dykman 100 Quentin Roosevelt Boulevard Garden City, New York 11530-4850

Eric Hartsfield, Director Julie Ford Williams Division of Customer Assistance Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue – P.O. Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350

Carolyn McIntosh, DAG Division of Law 124 Halsey Street – P.O. Box 45029 Newark, New Jersey 07101

FWO 11/22/11 RECEIVED 2011 NOV 22 AM 10: 10 BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES NEWARK. N.J.



BPU MATLROOM NOV 21 2011 RECE VED

*State of New Jersey* OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

> INITIAL DECISION SETTLEMENT OAL DKT. NO. PUC 8392-11 AGENCY DKT. NO. GC10090658U

MARY WHITMORE, Petitioner, v. PIVOTAL UTILITY HOLDINGS, INC. D/B/A ELIZABETHTOWN GAS

Respondent.

Naer

Bruce H. Bergen, Esq. for petitioner (Krevsky, Silber & Bergen, attorneys)

Deborah Franco, Esq., for respondent Elizabethtown Gas Company (Cullen & Dykman, LLC, attorneys)

Veronica Beke, Deputy Attorney General, for respondent Board of Public Utilities (Paula Dow, Attorney General of New Jersey, attorney)

Record Closed: October 28, 2011

Decided November 16, 2011

BEFORE IRENE JONES, ALJ:

# STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On July 14, 2011, this matter was transmitted to the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) for hearing as a contested case pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 52:14B-1 to -15 and <u>N.J.S.A</u>. 52:14F1 to -13.

The matter was scheduled for a hearing on September 23, 2011 but was adjourned because the parties agreed to settle the matter. An executed copy of the Settlement Agreement was forwarded to the OAL on October 28, 2011 and is attached hereto.

After reviewing the record and the settlement, I FIND:

- 1. The parties have voluntarily agreed to the settlement as evidenced by the signatures or the signatures of the representatives.
- 2. The settlement fully disposes of all issues in controversy and is consistent with the law and is in the public interest.

Therefore, I CONCLUDE that this agreement meets the requirements of <u>N.J.A.C.</u> 1:1-19.1(d) and should be approved. It is further ORDERED that the parties comply with the settlement terms and the proceedings be CONCLUDED.

I hereby FILE my initial decision with the BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES for consideration.

This recommended decision may be adopted, modified or rejected by the BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES, which by law is authorized to make a final decision in this matter. If the Board of Public Utilities does not adopt, modify or reject this decision within forty-five (45) days and unless such time limit is otherwise extended, this recommended decision shall become a final decision in accordance with *N.J.S.A.* 52:14B-10.

November 16, 2011

DATE

Date Received at Agency:

Date Mailed to Parties:

IRENE JONES.

### STATE OF NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

201 001 28 19 4:05

111 120

1.17

	X
Mary E. Whitmore	x
	x
ν.	x
	x
Elizabethtown Gas	x
	X

BPU Docket No. GC10090658U OAL Docket No. PUC 08392-2011N

## STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT

To the Honorable Board of Public Utilities:

WHEREAS, on September 13, 2010, Mary E. Whitmore ("Petitioner") filed a petition ("Petition") to dispute a \$668.00 charge that Petitioner now asserts is \$729.88.(the "Outstanding Balance") for natural gas service provided by Pivotal Utility Holdings, Inc. d/b/a Elizabethtown Gas ("Elizabethtown");

WHEREAS, Elizabethtown's records indicate that the Outstanding Balance reflects an amount owed for natural gas consumed by Petitioner for gas service provided to Petitioner's premises located at 710 Roselle Street, #1F, Linden, New Jersey 07036;

WHEREAS, on or about July 6, 2011, Elizabethtown filed an Answer to the Petition;

WHEREAS, while this matter was pending at the Board and the Office of Administrative Law, the parties engaged in negotiations and entered into this Stipulation of Settlement ("Stipulation"); and

WHEREAS, in the interests of resolving this matter without further delay, effort and cost, the parties hereto agree to settle this matter;

#### IT IS THEREFORE AGREED AS FOLLOWS:

1 Without agreeing with the merits of the allegations expressed in the Petition and in the interest of good customer relations and in recognition of the individual circumstances of this case, Elizabethtown agrees to adjust the Outstanding Balance downward to \$480.00 ("Adjusted Outstanding Balance"). This adjustment will be reflected on the billing statement issued to Petitioner after this Stipulation becomes effective as set forth in paragraph 2. below.

- -2.—To satisfy Petitioner's obligation under paragraph 1 to pay the Adjusted Outstanding Balance, within forty-five (45) days of an Administrative Law Judge Initial Decision approving this Stipulation, or within 10 days of a Board Order approving such Initial Decision, whichever is earlier, a twenty-four (24) month deferred payment agreement will commence pursuant to which Petitioner shall provide a monthly payment of \$20.00 ("\$20.00 Monthly Payment) to Elizabethtown in addition to Petitioner's monthly gas bill for natural gas service. Petitioner shall provide the \$20.00 Monthly Payment to Elizabethtown until Petitioner has paid the Adjusted Outstanding Balance in full. Petitioner's billing statement will reflect the existence of such deferred payment agreement.
  - 3. This Stipulation provides for a final resolution of this proceeding.
  - 4. The undersigned agree that this Stipulation contains mutually balancing and interdependent provisions and is intended to be accepted and approved in its entirety. In the event any particular aspect of this Stipulation is not accepted and approved by the Board or modified by the Board, the party that is adversely affected by the modification can either accept the modification or declare this Stipulation to be null and void, and the parties shall be placed in the same position that they were in immediately prior to its execution.

## **PIVOTAL UTILITY HOLDINGS, INC.** D/B/A ELIZABETHTOWN GAS

By: \_\_\_\_\_\_ Rabuen Keep ( dy Mary Patricia Keefe

Vice President, Regulatory Affairs

Dated: October 2011, 2011

۹. 👡

;

Mary E. Whitmore

Dated: October 1/2011